

Readers Forum

Delivered at Conference :
Sunday 9 November 2003

*Towards Better Mental Health Services in
Melbourne's Jewish Community*

"Sit down, Mr Cohen" said the psychologist.
"Now tell me what brings you here."

"People"? declared Cohen. "Stupid people,
Doctor. I tell you, I despair of the human race."

"Mm what is it that they actually do that makes
you so frustrated?"

"They call me crazy ... no matter what I say or
suggest I'm crazy; they just won't listen to
me..."

"Mr Cohen" says the psychologist gently,
"perhaps you ought to start at the beginning."

Cohen agrees: "OK. In the beginning I
created the humans and the earth".

While a G-d complex may be relatively rare
among Jews, there are a number of features in
our long and complex relationship with G-d
and Judaism which are neither rare nor
outrageous, but which colour and shape our
mental health.

I will argue today that a failure to address the
uniquely Jewish dimensions of those Jews
suffering a mental illness, those who are in
need of counselling or therapy, will hinder,
slow down and possibly even undermine their
efforts to heal. While what I'm saying may
appear to be self-evident, there is a body of
research which suggests that there is a lack of
attention to Jews as an ethnic minority within
multicultural societies a lack of attention by
both non-Jews and Jews themselves.

Despite the claim of inclusiveness and the
argument that ethical treatment must
acknowledge each client's culture, this has
typically not included Jews, even though so
many in the field are Jewish themselves. The
research I'm referring to stems from the late
80's and 90's when I was involved in my
training as a counsellor and was noted by Beck
(1991), Siegel (1991), Wiener (1991) and
others. I'm hopeful that this may have
changed or be changing, but if Nola Passmore
is right in her article in the current Australian
Psychologist (November 2003), Australian
counsellors and psychologists are still as a
whole reluctant to explore religious issues in
therapy and are slow to contribute to research
and training with regard to religious issues in
therapy.

There are, suggests Peter Langley (1995) a
number of reasons why cross-cultural
counselling has neglected the Jewish
dimension. The neglect of Jewish issues by
non-Jews stems first from the perception Jews
are so well integrated into general society that
they no longer constitute a separate culture.
Those who do stand out are seen as a religious
group and not a culture and because
Christians are not a major focus in cultural
studies, there's no reason to study Jews.

There is some truth to this point; we Jews are
great assimilators of culture, often becoming
more English than the English, more Ozzie
than the Australians. This is why intermarriage
is a cause of so much angst to the Jewish
community. Nevertheless, many if not the
majority, of assimilated, acculturated and non-
observant Jews still carry a strong sense of
being outside the mainstream White Australian
culture. Despite appearances they
experience themselves as members of a

What's mental health got to do with being Jewish?

Rabbi Ralph Genende

minority culture. Most Jews are acutely aware
that they are approximately 1/3 of 1% of the
world's population where 33% are Christians
and over 20% are Muslim.

The sense of being a minority, combined with
the knowledge of Jewish persecution; the
reality of the Holocaust (particularly significant
for the Melbourne Jewish community as
highlighted by George Halasz, Moshe Lang
and others); the exponential growth in anti-
Semitism since September 11 and the UN
Durban Conference; the ongoing trauma of the
conflict in Israel all of these factors make it
difficult for Jews to take their safety for granted.
In 1988 Jewish social commentator Leonard
Fein wrote

What is the first lesson a Jew learns? That
people want to kill Jews ... To be a Jew in
America, or anywhere, today is to carry with
you the consciousness of limitless savagery. It
is to carry that consciousness with you not as
an abstraction, but as a reality: not, G-d help us
all, only as memory, but also as possibility.

In 2003 this has an ever more urgent
resonance. To a non-Jewish therapist these
concerns may seem paranoid, to Jews who
live with the history and reality of anti-Semitism
from the vitriol of Mahatir to the more urbane
disdain of European society, their existence is
perennially in question.

I have alluded to another complex factor which
influences work with Jews suffering from
mental illness, viz Jews as a religious group.
While some (a minority of) Jews are primarily
religious and live their lives around Jewish
practices, observing strict laws that govern
every facet of their lives from a Kosher diet to a
strict observance of Sabbath. For most Jews
being Jewish entails more than belonging to a
religion

However even within the religious community
there is a range of Jewish definitions ranging
from ultra-Orthodox and Chassidic to modern
Orthodox and left-wing experimental.

For most Jews in Australia their identity is more
ethnic focusing on the cultural dimensions of
Judaism; traditional foods, customs, stories,
jokes and songs, perhaps with a sprinkling of
Yiddish.

Some Jews draw their identity from political
support of Israel, membership of a Zionist
organisation or fighting anti-Semitism. Others
define their Judaism by their holocaust
survivor status; this is especially so in
Melbourne.

Jews themselves are often confused by the
bewildering range of choices available to
them. Attempts to categorise Jews as ethnic,
religious or national are often inadequate.
Perhaps the most apt definition is that Judaism
is a religious civilisation, a lifestyle or a culture.

Langman (1995) refers to another significant
factor for the exclusion of Jews from the
multicultural matrix:

Jews are seen as not "needing" the same
attention that other groups do. Jews have
been referred to as a model minority because
of their success in adapting to Western
cultures. This "success" raises its own issues,
such as assimilation and intermarriage. Also,
although Jews as a group may be better off
materially than other minorities, this does not
negate the intensity and prevalence of anti-
Semitism; if anything, it may add to it by
"proving" the stereotype of the "rich Jews".

The truth of course is that not all Jews have
'made it'. One local Melbourne Jewish relief
fund distributed (during the past year) \$8,800
per month of meat subsidies - \$4,300 per
month of rent and utilities subsidies and so on
...

Notes Langman:

"It is limiting to think of oppression strictly in
terms of economics. Even if all Jews were
wealthy, they could still be victims of

■ Continued on page 4 ►

In memory of Simon

With trepidation I have approached the writing
of this obituary. What to say of someone I
have considered a friend, a man of great, and
at times impenetrable, depth. A person who I
felt I was supposed to help, heal and
overcome his many obstacles. Simon, you
may have never have realised this, that
although it seemed I was giving much to you,
you gave me so much more.

Implant in me, you tried, a love beyond this
material world. The trials and tribulations, that
at a superficial glance, you put me through,
were mostly such because of my own
expectations; expectations of give and
receive; a particular receive: that you would
change for, my version of, the better

This morn, I have awoken, eleven weeks after
your last breaths on this precious rock. A tear
is welling in my eye, I realise I miss you, our
conversations, intimations and realisations
about this beautiful yet cruel existence.

Ariel

Yesterday I read a bit of Erich Fromm,
haunted, because he echoed your words, in
his conception of love transforming from an
immature to mature state. You wrote in your
diary: "Mum, I used to love you because I
needed you, but now I need you because I
love you", this amongst many others the pearl
of wisdom that you imparted to me.

Your hugs conveyed what I felt, and still do,
that words are important but will never suffice
to describe emotion.

It is too late to complement you more, but the
rest of the world should know that the
righteous are often hidden and whence found
are to be appreciated.

Thank you, from the depths of my aching soul,
crying as I pen these words in memory of you.

From Constituent Organisations

In the last twelve months Wings of Care has
developed in several new areas.

We started our Drop-in Group on a Sunday
afternoon. This activity has been in the
melting-pot for quite some time until I decided
to run this activity in my home. The group likes
coming to my place because they say it is
'homely', and I enjoy having them.

Mandy Malinek our Voluntary Occupational
Therapist runs the sessions for us and we have
had so far: Goal setting and time
management; Anger management; Getting
back to work after a mental illness; De-clutter
and its maintenance, and general nutrition will
be presented soon.

Another program planned is based on
Optimum Nutrition for the Mind - from the book
if that title by Patrick Holford and will be given
by Rachel Arthur, a Naturopath with a passion
for this topic. Notes from all our sessions are
posted on our Consumer Website on
www.vicnet.net.au/~msupport. The email
address is MSsupport@swiftsl.com.au.

Nira Shani takes a lot of our programmes on
Thursday nights at the moment with holistic
creative art sessions and the group enjoys
relaxing and unwinding in her sessions and
then creating. Nira and her friend and
associate Timna Kenny entertain a cross-
section of Wings of Care members with their
music at our Chanukah and Purim
celebrations. Everyone enjoys themselves at



these parties. We have the appropriate Yom
Tov foods at these times also. We will soon be
having Massage with Elfie Weiss one of our
consultants and a qualified and experienced
Social Worker. There will also be creative
writing taken by Julie Szego an experienced
Journalist very soon.

Aaron Benhanou entertained us on his
electrical guitar in a pre Rosh Hashana party
with singing as well. All present enjoyed
themselves by singing along and dancing.

We are about to set up a group to participate
with Conference Calls on a regular weekly
Wednesday afternoon basis.

Misha Nathani has recently joined the Board of
Wings of Care and we welcome him warmly.
He is an experienced Social Worker and
brings to our organization a multitude of
talents.

A function on the drawing-board at this time is
a forum for mental health professionals in the
wider community to learn about how to look

"Why me G-d?"

A book by Lisa Aiken

I was lucky enough to acquire an extract from Adena
Ucko of a book called "Why me G-d?" by Lisa Aiken.
With such a title it was obvious that there would be
special treasures that would identify some Jewish
attitudes to mental health issues.

I was given a copy of the chapter called
"Understanding and Coping with Emotional
Problems". I have selected two areas for discussion
here. Guilt and Shame, and Baggage.

In addressing the first, the authoress says,"
Secularists teach that most guilt is bad and that an
enormous amount of mental illness is due to shame
and guilt. Judaism says that these negative feelings
are important for our growth, provided we channel
them constructively. Our Creator knows that we are
human and expects us to make mistakes, so He gave
us these feelings to motivate us to right our wrongs,
let go of the past, and be better in the future.

By sincerely repenting our mistakes, we can forgive
ourselves and not ruin the rest of our lives torturing
ourselves for what we did wrong."

"Repentance", she goes on to say, "involves
regretting and verbalizing to G-d what we did wrong,
making amends, apologizing to people we hurt, and
resolving never to repeat our misdeeds.

We ask G-d, not an intermediary, to forgive us,
because we are personally responsible to Him for
everything that we do. If we use shame and guilt to
improve ourselves, they serve an important function".

On the subject of Baggage, that is, things that we
experienced at different stages of life that may not
have been pleasant, it is suggested that we have
choices, to either use these bad experiences to
excuse our choices in attitudes today or learn to
overcome the past and become stronger and more
special as we learn to overcome them.

Institute for Judaism and Civilization

This past (Jewish) year the Institute for Judaism and
Civilization has pressed ahead with various explorations
of the relationship of Judaism and psychotherapy. A seminar
given by Dr Mottel Greenbaum late in 2003 was published
in Volume 5 of the Journal of Judaism and Civilization,
published in 2004. In it he explored ways in which he was
able therapeutically to introduce concepts of Chassidic
philosophy to patients suffering from a variety of clinical
psychological illnesses. Interesting is not only the way in
which these concepts helped the patients to transform their
own conditions, but the timing and mode of the therapist's
introduction of these concepts in the course of clinical
therapy. The Institute also held a four-part seminar series
entitled "Religiosity and Spirituality in Counseling and
Psychotherapy, which attracted CPD points from the
RACGP. It began with a talk by Professor Kate Loewenthal of
the University of London exploring "Issues in religiously
sensitive therapy: practical guidelines". Here Professor

Loewenthal drew upon her practical experience with
different ethno-religious groups in London with their own
counseling organizations. Another session with Dr
Greenbaum, along the lines of his earlier contribution, this
time focused on "Applications of 'love of one's fellow' in
clinical practice. The next session by Dr Craig Hassed, who
has done extensive work in body-mind medicine, was
entitled "The efficacy of spiritual elements in counseling".
Rabbi Dr Shimon Cowen also contributed a paper on the one
of the greatest contributors to the invocation of the spiritual
faculty of the human being in therapy, Viktor Frankl, the
centenary of whose birth occurs in 2005. The presentation
looked at spiritual interventions, proposed by Frankl, in such
severe clinical circumstances as schizophrenia. To contact
the Institute in relation to its publications and activities in the
relationship of spirituality and psychotherapy write to
ijc@mail.com or telephone (03) 9527 5902.

after Jewish patients whilst they are in hospital.
Rebbitzin Vera Link who is a Diversional
Therapist will provide the information for this
forum.

The latest happening that took place and has
had an effect on us, in the last 12 months, is the
establishing of the JCCV Social Justice
Committee. Wings of Care became an affiliate
of the JCCV sometime last year and as we are
looking at lifting the profile and future
improvement of mental health services in our
community becoming a member of the Social
Justice Committee became appropriate. We
are actually founding members and we have
already had our first function - a Forum on
Poverty.

The very existence of this Committee and its
positive potential standing in our Community
made me realize that Wings of Care needed its
own Website, among other things. One of the
projects that we embarked on was to create a
Charter on mental health for community
members to commit to its ideals. People can
do this on a hard copy and also via the new
Website where it will be found. Comments can
privately be posted on it.

There are many ideas that I am currently
proposing to the SJ Committee for the future
which can be left for our next Newsletter's
publication.

Lorraine

Mental First Aid

A number of Hatzolah Responders recently attended a
Mental Health First Aid Course run by the Australian
National University and the Centre for Mental Health
Research which was found to be extremely informative.
The knowledge gained during this course will be helpful
for Hatzolah Responders to provide support to people
experiencing a Mental Health problem before professional
help becomes available.

For more information, please contact:
Tony Hoare RN BA BAppSc MNSt
Accredited MHFA Instructor

Ph: 9827 6722 Fax: 9827 6733
Email: action.education@bigpond.com - Website:
www.mhfa.com.au

Holocaust and Trauma Support Services

Holocaust and Trauma Support Services (H.A.T.S.S.)
acknowledges that, for Holocaust survivors, the
challenges of ageing may have special meaning in light
of their war experiences, reactivating painful memories
from the past. Our team aims to increase
understanding of trauma-related issues through
education and skills-based training (to community
health care providers and professionals) and, in so
doing, facilitate best possible service delivery to
Holocaust survivors and to other groups in society who
have suffered the effects of war and other trauma.

In response to the needs of survivors and their families
H.A.T.S.S. also offers individual and family
counselling, and Art Therapy.

The H.A.T.S.S. team, Julia Blum, Carmella Grynberg
and Denise Same, has extensive experience in
counselling and presenting workshops and tailor-made
training programs to organisations with a significant
part of our practice focusing on issues facing
Holocaust survivors and their families.
Please phone 9500-0610 for further information and
bookings. E-mail: hatss@counsellor.com

■ from page 2 ▶

oppression. Blacks who achieve financial success are not magically delivered from the impact of racism. Neither are women immune to sexism simply because of economic status. Anti-Semitism victimises Jews, rich or poor.

... when it comes to working with individual clients, the socio-economic status of their cultural group may have little or no bearing on their personal difficulties. The idea of multicultural counselling is that appropriate treatment recognises the role of culture in clients' lives; this holds true regardless of economic status."

The lack of attention to Jewish issues in psychology is not limited to Jews. Jews themselves are often responsible of contributing to this. This is due to a cluster of factors inter alia the deep ambivalence many Jews have towards their own Jewishness. They carry a profound split within their identities and possess in K D Lang's phrase, divided selves. It is also worth noting that many Jews bear a fear of being visible as Jews - this is particularly so in the Holocaust survivor population.

I would like to share some of the insightful albeit tongue-in-cheek observations of prominent Melbourne psychologist and family therapist, Moshe Lang:

Perhaps, for my Jewish patients, I use different diagnostic categories. For instance, with one of the first families I saw, the father complained about his daughter, who kept borrowing money and failing to pay it back. To him it was evidence that she was suffering from schizophrenia. I suggested to him that perhaps it was simply because she was a shnorrer (one who cadges or borrows persistently). As a further example, the wife of a couple who came to see me complained bitterly that her husband was arrogant and a show-off. She was worried that this was evidence of manic depressive illness. The husband was deeply hurt and vigorously rejected her assertions. They were worlds apart, caught up in a vicious cycle of accusations and counter-accusations. Eventually I suggested that he may simply be a shvitzer (one who sweats a lot by implication a hothead or show off). This had the advantage of providing a common language in which they argued about whether he was a big shvitzer or a little one. To parents who are worried about their children suffering from minimal brain damage or ADD or whatever, I often suggest that they may have shpilkers (pins and needles or inability to sit still), and so it goes with shlamuzzel (a person devoid of luck), shlumiel, (a clumsy person), gunnev (a thief), meshugga (mad), meshugga religious, kvetche (a whinger), and so on. I strongly commend the Jewish diagnostic categories.

In the same way that Jewish terms are useful in dealing with individual psychopathology, Jewish sayings are helpful in a whole range of life stages and family situations. Thus, to Jewish parents who complain that they have worried enough, I quote a famous Jewish saying, 'Little children little problems, big children big problems'. What is less well known is the equivalent: 'Small children don't let you sleep; big children don't let you rest'. I remind mothers who complain about being expected to be everywhere at once of the Jewish saying, 'since G-d could not be

everywhere, he created mothers'. I offer a range of responses to parents who complain that their children don't appreciate what is done for them and are too materialistic, always wanting more. I say that the children are suffering from 'affluenza' and tell the following Jewish joke.

Rockefeller gives a waiter in a restaurant a \$10 tip and when the waiter complains, 'Mr Rockefeller, your son was here yesterday and he left me a tip of \$100,' he replies, 'Yes, it's easy for him. He has a rich father.'

All of the above factors leave us with two challenges:

To ensure the non-Jewish therapeutic world

■ from page 1 ▶

Putting People First

The following article has been published by the Western Australia Government

Disability and Appropriate Language A Guide

Why use positive language?

Language reflects and shapes the way we view the world. The words we use can influence community attitudes - both positively and negatively - and can impact on the lives of others.

How we write and speak about people with disabilities can have a profound effect on the way they are viewed by the community. Some words, by their very nature, degrade and diminish people with disabilities. Others perpetuate inaccurate stereotypes, removing entirely a person's individuality and humanity.

Over the years, people with disabilities have had to endure a variety of labels that serve to set them apart from the rest of the community. Even today, people with disabilities are still identified by their disabling condition - all too often, we hear 'a paraplegic' for a person who has a paraplegia; 'a cerebral palsy sufferer' for a person with cerebral palsy or 'a Down syndrome baby' for a baby with Down syndrome.

This labelling influences our perceptions by focussing only on one aspect of a person their disability and ignores their other roles and attributes, for example they may be also a parent, a lawyer, a musician or a sportsperson.

This guide aims to promote a fair, accurate and positive portrayal of people with disabilities. "Putting People First" is a simple rule of thumb acknowledge the person before their disability.

General guidelines

- Don't define a person by their disability. We are all individuals with abilities, desires, interests and problems some of us happen to have a disability.

- Avoid focussing unnecessarily on a person's disability. If it is not necessary to acknowledge that a person has a disability, then don't mention it.

- Portray people with disabilities positively by recognising what a person can do rather than focussing on their limitations, for example, the person walks with an aid, not that he or she has limited mobility.

- Recognise that many of the difficulties facing people with a disability are barriers created by community attitudes and the physical environment. We can all help to break down these barriers by using appropriate language to be labelled in a derogatory way serves only to perpetuate these barriers.

and in our case the Melbourne therapeutic community, is educated about the unique constellation of factors that comprise Judaism.

To ensure that Jewish clients have access to appropriate Jewish mental health workers.

I am not suggesting a monocultural approach although under some circumstances this is not only desirable, but in fact the only viable path. I am however suggesting we address the unspoken assumptions that underlie a multicultural approach vis a vis Judaism.

In conclusion it is surely obvious that mental health has a lot, and sometimes everything to do with being Jewish.



The Importance of Language

Language is vitally important: how we use language affects facts, perceptions and emotions. Describing the mind is particularly challenging - hence, definitions of mental health and social wellbeing are much more complex than those for physical health. A combination of factors influence an individual's mental health, including the interaction of social, economic and environmental conditions with an individual's heredity, luck, knowledge and skills.

According to Vic Health (1999), mental health is the embodiment of social, emotional and spiritual wellbeing. Mental health provides individuals with the vitality necessary for active living, to achieve goals and to interact with one another in ways that are respectful and just (VicHealth 1999).

The National Mental Health Strategy defines mental health as "the product of biological, psychological and social factors."

The Australian Health Ministers agreed in 1991 that "mental health is the capacity of individuals within groups and the environment to interact with one another in ways that promote subjective wellbeing, optimal development and use of mental abilities (cognitive, affective and relational) and achievement of collective goals consistent with justice".

A mental health problem is a disruption in the interactions between the individual, the group and the environment producing a diminished state of mental health; a mental health disorder is a diagnosable illness that significantly interferes with an individual's cognitive, emotional or social abilities.

Mental health problems range from short term issues experienced by people adjusting to life events such as grief, divorce, loss, changed work and other life circumstances, to severe and complex problems that

are highly disabling or life threatening (eg. acute psychosis or depression), or are unremitting or unresponsive to other interventions.

Ways of dealing with these problems can involve support from family, friends and informal community supports, or more specialist interventions such as psychological, pharmacological, family and social strategies.

While this framework has general relevance, it must be remembered that mental illness or mental health problems are broad terms. For every individual experiencing mental health problems, the following characteristics must be considered:

- Just as each person is a unique human being, each mental illness has unique features
- Many mental illnesses are episodic in nature
- The impact of mental illness varies widely
- A range of conditions is included in 'mental illness'.

Labels and diagnoses, while clarifying terminology and enabling a shared understanding of mental illness, can also be unhelpful and limiting in addressing society's general attitudes and in recognising the unique nature of any individual.

In the area of mental health, it is important to use accurate and appropriate terminology to assist understanding. Using the right language in the right situation is just as important - broad categories and descriptors are most useful for reporting information, service provision, planning and policy making but are less appropriate for describing individuals and their specific needs and abilities.

Dr. Ruth Vine

Director of Mental Health Victoria

The article following this preamble

serves as a guide to professionals in the disability field about the best means by which to refer to people with disabilities. It must be noted that whilst this paper is helpful for the professionals who work with people with disabilities it is not necessarily the best approach in social circumstances outside a professional realm. The fact that a person has a disability is not always a relevant factor and when introducing a friend who has a psychiatric disability at a party for example it is not necessary to state that your friend has a psychiatric disability.

Training people to behave linguistically in a particular way is not usually very effective which is why people often make fun of so called politically correct language. Changes in language go only part of the way towards addressing issues of stigma. The real changes have to involve social attitudes.

The following guide is also limited in that it does not make a clear distinction between the medical and social references to disabilities. The use of the term person with a psychiatric illness is very different from the use of the term person with a psychiatric disability as is the difference for example between the term a person with paraplegia and a person with a physical

JEWISH MENTAL HEALTH NETWORK (VIC)

Mission Statement

Victorian Jewish Mental Health Organizations linking together as a Network, participating as a resource with each other and to the community by the process of referral. We are also providing a forum for sharing knowledge and professional expertise with each other and the community.

Aims. To provide

1. A raising of consciousness of mental health issues in the Jewish community.
2. Improved services for the Jewish community resulting from organizations being more aware of each other's roles through networking. To investigate solutions for the filling of gaps in the service and avoid duplication.
3. An increase in community awareness of Jewish mental health organizations and professionals as well as of other individuals and organizations acceptable to the network, and how to access these.
4. An opportunity to exchange mental health information and expertise between participating organizations.
5. Liaison with Jewish mental health bodies from interstate and overseas.
6. A public advocacy role for improved mental health services in relation to the Jewish community.
7. An opportunity for wider community mental health professionals to access Jewish mental health professionals and organizations.
8. To publish a newsletter publicizing services, projects and concerns of the network and to compile and update lists of recipients of the newsletter.

Member Organisations of the Network

- Chevra Hatzolah
- The Holocaust Centre
- H.A.T.S.S.
- Institute of Judaism & Civilization Inc.
- J.E.M.P.
- Jewish Care - Melbourne Inc.
- Jewish Chaplancy
- Jewish Taksforce Against Family Violence
- Wings of Care - (Kanfei Chesed) Inc.